

VOLUME VII

OCCUPATIONAL MOBILITY PATTERNS: An Examination of Leadership, Access, Opportunity, Social Capital and the Reshuffling Effect within the NFL

## Principal Investigator and Lead Researcher:

Dr. C. Keith Harrison, Associate Professor, College of Business Administration at University of Central Florida

A report presented by the National Football League.

# Table of Contents

Message from Troy Vincent, NFL Executive Vice President of Football Operations
Message from C. Keith Harrison, Lead Investigator and Researcher
Report Background
Review of Literature on Occupational Mobility Patterns
Research Methodology 8
Findings and Results
Discussion and Conclusions: Practical Recommendations and Implications
References
Bios of Research Team & Report Authors



# OCCUPATIONAL MOBILITY PATTERNS: AN EXAMINATION OF LEADERSHIP, ACCESS, OPPORTUNITY, SOCIAL CAPITAL AND THE RESHUFFLING EFFECT WITHIN THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE

(Volume VII) April 2018

Lead Investigator and Researcher



Dr. C. Keith Harrison

Associate Professor & Associate Chair

College of Business AdministrationSport Business Management

ProgramUniversity of Central Florida

#### **Researcher and Report Co-Author**



Scott Bukstein Associate Program Director & Instructor College of Business Administration Sport Business Management Program University of Central Florida

A report presented by the National Football League

Recommended citation for report: Harrison, C.K. and Bukstein, S. (2018). Occupational Mobility Patterns: An Examination of Leadership, Access, Opportunity, Social Capital and the Reshuffling Effect Within the National Football League (Volume VII).

This report is available online at http://www.coachingmobilityreport.com.

## MESSAGE FROM TROY VINCENT, NFL EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT OF FOOTBALL OPERATIONS

Since the Rooney Rule was introduced in 2003, there has been a nearly 3-fold increase in the number of minority Head Coaches in the NFL. While this is progress, we can do better. One of our goals is to improve the sustainability of minority hiring in coaching and front office positions, particularly head coaches and the position coaches that often lead to becoming a head coach.

We want to ensure that occupational mobility for minority prospects is a solid foundation for advancement; with substance over form, and a real opportunity rather than checking a box to comply with the Rule. The NFL issued new guidelines for the Rooney Rule in March 2018, requiring clubs to hold open head coaching or senior football operations positions for at least one week during which time at least two minority candidates shall be interviewed. While this will likely improve opportunities, there are still systemic issues to be addressed for accomplishing real sustainability.

For example, minority coaches remain concentrated in certain position coaches– running backs, receivers, and defensive backs. Yet, the path to the headset has changed (and changes every year) and minority coaches are underrepresented in positions that lead to head coaching opportunities -- e.g., coordinators, quarterback and quality control coaches. This is of little value in a year when clubs are looking for experience on the defensive side of the ball. Our focus building a deep and wide talent pool should match the shifting paths leading to the head coaching opportunities should be emphasized. Doing so will generate momentum in the pipeline and reduce the "Reshuffling Effect" of the same people cycling through coaching positions that lead to head coaching opportunities after their first head coaching experience.

The NFL Occupational Mobility Report Volume VII identifies these needs and analyzes certain phenomena serving as barriers to entry and advancement for minority candidates. Each year, we strive to do better than the previous year. This report not only measures our significant progress—and there is progress—it serves as a way to inject accountability into the journey to our ultimate goal of a fair, diverse and equality-based workplace

# MESSAGE FROM LEAD AUTHOR OF THE REPORT, DR. C. KEITH HARRISON

For the past three years during the first night of our undergraduate course "Diversity and Social Issues in Sport," I have invited Dr. Thaddeus Rivers to come in to present his research on African American head coaches at the collegiate level. His doctoral dissertation African American head football coaches at Division I FBS schools: A qualitative study on turning points, examines the experiences and inequalities of the mobility path for men of color, specifically for African American males. His findings parallel most of the conclusions we have garnered from the data on NFL head coaches, coordinators, general managers, and position coaches during the past six years related to occupational mobility patterns. The reshuffling of the status quo is similar at both the collegiate and professional football levels, and often the exchange of men at both competitive levels in these leadership roles reveals a paradigm that is perplexing—in part because hiring decisions might not even be based on wins and losses yet instead based on who knows who. One of my undergraduate students listening to Dr. Rivers on January 10, 2018 expressed these thoughts in her thank you note to him for coming to guest lecture; the below note really captures what continues to perplex the common observer of this topic of mobility, diversity, and leadership:

"Dear Dr. Rivers, thank you so much for taking the time to speak to our class. My father is a high school football coach and it was never really that clear to me that there were not a lot of African American head coaches. This is crazy to me because there are so many talented, hard- working, and intelligent African American football players. I hope this changes in the future. Thanks again for coming in (from Olivia Gottman)."

The facts are there and I agree with my student. Let's hope that the data from the most recent mobility report on good business with diversity and inclusion continues to drive decisions that are equitable and representative of opportunity. That is when the American Dream truly becomes a reality for this game called football that so many love, watch, and pay attention to.

## **REPORT BACKGROUND**

In 1921, Fritz Pollard became the first person of color hired as a head coach of a professional football team. Pollard, an African American, coached the Akron Pros and Hammond Pros from 1921-1925. Employment opportunities in professional football for coaches of color were limited following the leadership of Pollard. From the time of Pollard's last game coaching in 1925, it would be more than 40 years before another person of color would serve as the head coach of a professional football team (and more than 60 years before the next African American head coach). Tom Fears, a Latino coach, became the first ethnic minority head coach hired during the modern NFL era in 1967. Art Shell became the first African American head coach in the modern NFL era when he was hired by the Los Angeles Raiders in 1989. From January 1963 to February 2018, only 18 different African American men and three Latino men have served as head coaches in the NFL. As of February 2018, eight head coaches of color led NFL teams as compared with 24 White NFL head coaches. Five of the eight current NFL head coaches of color have been hired since January 2015. This NFL Diversity & Inclusion research report series began analyzing data on occupational mobility patterns and making data-driven policy and best practices recommendations commencing at the start of the 2012 NFL regular season.

Previous empirical and other data-driven studies on NFL coaches and other key team leaders have generally focused on the effectiveness of the Rooney Rule (for example, analyzing the hiring process and proposing new strategies to increase the number of head coaches of color) and comparing the win/loss records of head coaches (for example, determining whether coaches of color are provided with a true meaningful opportunity to turn around a team with a losing record) (see Cochran & Mehri, 2002; Madden & Ruther, 2011; Thornton, 2009).

The current study on occupational mobility patterns expands and complements existing research within this space via an extensive analysis related to whether ethnic minorities face occupational access barriers after one or more stints as a head coach in the NFL. In addition, this research study examines occupational access barriers and mobility patterns with respect to NFL general managers, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and other primary NFL team position coaches—for example, quarterbacks coach, wide receivers coach, tight ends coach, running backs coach, offensive line coach, linebackers coach, defensive line coach and defensive backs (secondary) coach. The current empirical research study aims to address the following research questions:

- 1. Do coaches and other leaders of color within the NFL face actual (and perceived) access barriers with respect to occupational mobility patterns?
- 2. What factors and variables impact and influence the occupational mobility patterns of coaches and other leaders of color within the NFL?
- 3. What are examples of innovative practical strategies with respect to improving career opportunities for coaches and other leaders of color within the NFL?

Based on the findings of the current study, the NFL and teams within the league must continue to focus on retention, career progression, continued access and "life after being a head coach" in addition to the central goal of the Rooney Rule related to initial entry/access for ethnic minorities.<sup>1</sup> The findings of the current study indicate that, historically, NFL teams have been reluctant to hire a person of color for a head coach, offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator position after a person of color has previously served as a head coach in the NFL. For example, since the start of the 1963 NFL season, 107 White individuals have been hired as an NFL head coach, offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator after a first NFL head coach opportunity, whereas only 15 men of color have been hired as an NFL head coach, offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator after a first NFL head coach opportunity, whereas only 15 men of color have been hired as an NFL head coach, offensive coordinator after a first NFL season, 24 White individuals have been hired as an NFL head coach opportunity, whereas only three men of color have been hired as an NFL head coach, offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator or defensive coordinator after a second NFL head coach opportunity, whereas only three men of color have been hired as an NFL head coach, offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator after a second NFL head coach opportunity.

However, the hiring of Lovie Smith and Jim Caldwell as "second opportunity" NFL head coaches in 2014 along with the hiring of Hue Jackson as a "second opportunity" NFL head coach in January 2016 serve as indicators of improvement and hope. As of February 2018, ten out of the 21 total head coaches of color from 1963-2018 have earned a second opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team. A primary challenge for candidates of color is breaking into the head coach pipeline, as many head coaches and key position coaches continue to get "reshuffled" thereby preventing new talent from entering the candidate pipeline. For example, 14 of the 19 recently hired offensive coordinators have previously served as an NFL offensive coordinator. The following review of

<sup>\*1.</sup> It is important to note that mere technical compliance with Rooney Rule requirements does not guarantee that men of color are truly provided with a meaningful opportunity to compete for open general manager and head coach positions.

literature section provides an overview of relevant empirical research on occupational mobility patterns in the sport business industry. Social capital theory, particularistic mobility thesis, minority vulnerability thesis and performancereward bias constructs provide a foundational theoretical framework for the current research study.

The following review of literature section provides an overview of relevant empirical research on occupational mobility patterns in the sport business industry. Social capital theory, particularistic mobility thesis and performance-reward bias constructs provide a foundational theoretical framework for the current research study.

## REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON OCCUPATIONAL MOBILITY PATTERNS

#### **Performance-Reward Bias**

Rider et al. (2016) researched racial disparity in NFL leadership positions and examined how "performance-reward bias (i.e., lesser rewards for equivalent performance) generates racial disparity in leadership by suppressing the rate at which minorities, relative to equally-performing whites, are promoted to positions considered prerequisite for organizational leadership" (p. 1). These scholars found that performance-reward bias was prevalent in lower level positions (e.g., position coaches)—for instance, coaches of color were initially hired into positions with inferior promotion prospects and then subsequently "stacked" into positions with similarly inferior promotion prospects. As explained by Rider et al. (2016), performance-reward bias "is a specific within-job mechanism that generates differential returns to position for equivalent performance in the same position . . . performance-reward bias implies that even when racial minorities are allocated to relatively promising positions they are less likely to continue ascending the corporate hierarchy as white, equivalently-performing position-holders" (pp. 2, 9). This empirical research study by Rider et al. (2016) suggests "pipeline programs designed to increase diversity in leadership by increasing diversity in lower level positions are undermined by performance-reward bias" (p. 6). For example, performance-reward bias in key lower level positions such as quarterbacks coach, linebackers coach and defensive backs (secondary) coach results in access barriers for men of color with respect to the inability of attaining key leadership positions such as offensive coordinator and defensive coordinator. Rider et al. (2016) found "clear evidence of a racial disparity in promotion prospects for NFL assistant coaches that has persisted for over two decades despite a high-profile intervention designed to advance the candidacies of minority candidates" (p. 36).

## Particularistic Mobility Thesis and Minority Vulnerability Thesis

Day (2015) investigated the effects of job-level, task-based segregation on racial differences in college football coaching promotions. Day (2015) examined the connection between occupational attainment of college coaches and the particularistic mobility thesis. The particularistic mobility thesis can be defined as "the predominant theoretical explanation for racial/ethnic differences in both authority attainment and promotions in the labor market, particularly in high-status professions" (p. 3). As explained by Day (2015), "According to the particularistic mobility thesis, performance indicators in high-level positions are inherently vague and uncertain and the characteristics that upper management looks for when considering promotions such as loyalty, leadership potential, trustworthiness, and achievement orientation are not easily measured and quantified. This opens promotion decisions to 'particularistic manipulation,' or the subjective (mis)perceptions of upper level managers" (p. 3). Day (2015) further explained that, as a result of these (mis)perceptions of key decision makers, "minority workers follow a more circumscribed pathway to high-level positions where they are limited to formal channels of mobility based on their objective experience, credentials and skills. White workers, on the other hand, not only have access to formal channels of mobility but also benefit from the subjective and sometimes biased assessments of their skills and abilities" (pp. 3-4). Day (2015) suggested that candidates of color experience "restricted access to jobs, occupations, and economic sectors that offer the opportunity to develop requisite human capital, social network contacts, and display the particularistic criteria necessary for promotion into high-status jobs and occupations has been implicated in divergent mobility outcomes for White and Black workers" (p. 2).

In a similar recent empirical research study that investigated racial differences in occupational mobility patterns of college football coaches, Day (2018) found that, "congruent with the particularistic mobility thesis, black coaches were less likely than white coaches to traverse mobile career patterns and, congruent with the minority vulnerability thesis, were more likely to become stuck in stagnant career trajectories characterized by low-level positions that presumably make them more vulnerable to dismissal and downward mobility" such as being demoted/reassigned from defensive coordinator to linebackers coach (p. 11).<sup>3</sup> Day (2018) also examined the impact of rushed/hurried hiring decisions—according to the particularistic mobility and minority vulnerability theses, the "quick, secret, and

<sup>\*2.</sup> In March 2016, Lovie Smith became the first former NFL head coach of color to be named a head coach of a college football team in the Football Bowl Subdivision when he accepted the head football coach position at the University of Illinois.

<sup>\*3</sup> The minority vulnerability thesis posits that "African Americans experience different rates of promotion, are less likely to attain authoritative positions within work organizations, and are more likely to experience downward mobility in high status occupations" (Day, 2018, p. 2)

informal processes are expected to produce better outcomes for white coaches and worse outcomes for black coaches" (p. 12).

#### **Unconscious Bias and Social Capital**

Scholars have previously examined how unconscious bias and aversive racism impact occupational mobility (for example, see Bridgeman, 2008; Dovidio & Gaertner, 1998; and Greenwald & Krieger, 2006). Because these processes and biases are "subtle and operate largely by default" (Wang, 2006, p. 16), company decision-makers (e.g., general managers of NFL teams) are prone to categorize and stereotype with respect to a candidate's qualifications for a specific opportunity without any intent or conscious awareness. As explained by Bridgeman (2008), "many people who do not consider themselves to be racist or sexist and who generally may want to have a diverse working environment may still select people for participation in ways that are biased and discriminatory" (p. 267). Collins (2007) examined the impact of the Rooney Rule and the importance of "social capital." Collins suggested, "due in large part to unconscious bias, these networks tend to reinforce traditional power structures by limiting hiring practices and/or business transactions to other elites or acquaintances within the network . . . Since it is unconscious, this bias is neither cognitive nor intentional . . . unconscious bias influences head coaching selections through the internalization of stereotypes regarding African Americans' intellectual inferiority and the establishment and maintenance of 'old boy' networks" (pp. 875, 876).

Social capital can be defined as "the goodwill that is engendered by the fabric of social relations and that can be mobilized to facilitate action" (Adler & Kwon, 2002, p. 17). Social capital influences career success (see Gabbay & Zuckerman, 1998) and creates a richer pool of recruits for companies (see Fernandez, Castilla, & Moore, 2000). Day and McDonald (2010) analyzed the "differential processes by which social capital influences occupational attainment of whites and racial minorities" with respect to collegiate football coaches; these scholars found that people of color often lack the social capital resources (i.e., resources embedded in networks) needed to facilitate occupational advancement (p. 140). Day and McDonald (2010) found that same race contacts and strong ties are positively associated with the number of promotions received by White coaches; however, those same ties were found to be the least effective for African American coaches because "a diverse set of weak-tied network resources offer the greatest opportunities for promotion among black coaches . . . access to higher status contacts also appears to be a more important predictor of mobility among black coaches than among white coaches" (p. 140).

Scholars such as Maume (1999) and Wilson et al. (1999) have found that individuals of color must invest more in personal relationships, attaining advanced education degrees, and accumulating substantial relevant work experience before job advancement prospects become equivalent to the promotion opportunities of White individuals. Rosette et al. (2008) developed a theory-based argument with respect to whether variables such as "institutional inequality" (Davis & Moore, 1945, p. 243; see also Acker, 2006) and "membership in powerful coaching families" (Greene, 2012, p. 131) have more of an impact in the hiring and evaluation processes than do the substantive skill sets of individuals.

Sagas and Cunningham (2005) analyzed social capital of college football coaches with respect to network size, strength of ties/relationships, racial similarity within network, contacts in higher levels of organization, and interorganizational ties. Sagas and Cunningham (2005) in part found that "White coaches have more opportunities to accrue occupational experience because they are more likely to occupy positions" (p. 791). Sagas and Cunningham (2005) also highlighted past research that has indicated cross-race networking ties are typically weaker (i.e., less effective) than matching-race networking connections; however, candidates of color typically have a "much smaller set of 'similar others' from whom to develop professional relationships" (p. 791). This reality is significant as Sagas and Cunningham (2005) explained that the "lack of same-race ties among Black coaches thus can be detrimental to the development and success of Black coaches" (p. 791). In a similar empirical research study, Cunningham and Sagas (2005) analyzed the notion of access discrimination with respect to coaching positions in college athletics. These scholars found that, based on the predominance of same-race hiring practices, personnel decisions in college athletics are often influenced by "who you know who is racially similar" (p. 157).

Kilduff et al. (2016) recently extended the social network research literature with an empirical investigation related to the career mobility impact of aspiring NFL head coach candidates (i.e., "acolytes")<sup>4</sup> developing "advantageous connections" with high-reputation industry leaders (e.g., NFL head coaches such as Bill Belichick and Mike Tomlin). These scholars investigated the occupational mobility patterns of 1,298 NFL head coaches and position coaches from 1980-2010 in order to determine the long-term significance of initially beneficial workplace ties between acolytes and high-reputation leaders. Kilduff et al. (2016) concluded, "affiliation with a successful leader can facilitate or damage career progress, even in an industry in which quantitative indicators of performance are

<sup>\*4.</sup> An "acolyte" can be defined as someone who has experience working on the same management team as one or more high-reputation leaders (see Kilduff et al., 2016).

routinely used to assess outcomes" (p. 371). Kilduff et al. (2016) observed that "high-reputation social connections can be considered not just as signals of underlying quality" but also as "lenses that potentially distort individuals' qualities both beneficially (in terms of enhancing the value of prior performance) and detrimentally (in terms of ex post settling up)" (pp. 369-70). One of the primary practical implications of the research study was as follows: "The results concerning NFL promotions indicate an industry system in which social connections, rather than just skills and abilities, enable people to move into positions such as head coach" (p. 370).

Seebruck and Savage (2013) examined how an assistant coach's race and the race of his supervisor (the head coach) interact to affect occupational mobility. Seebruck and Savage (2013) found that African American collegiate basketball assistant coaches working under African American head coaches ("black homophily") were significantly disadvantaged with respect to the probability of earning a head coaching position; results indicated that while homophily (same race connection) is neither advantageous nor disadvantageous for White job candidates, it is disadvantageous for African American job candidates. As explained by Seebruck and Savage (2013), "this racially based disadvantage makes it difficult for minority job candidates to break through the glass ceiling and has real-world financial implications . . . effort should be directed at ensuring that white coaches continue to hire and sponsor capable minority assistant coaches" (pp. 75, 98).

## RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research study investigated data regarding NFL head coach demographics, tenure, and occupational mobility patterns from 1963-2018. This specific range of years is utilized because 1963 serves as the first year that the NFL began to track relevant data on head coach mobility patterns. Based on the NFL archival human resource database on head coaches, these data were analyzed to determine occupational mobility patterns. Interim head coaches were not included in the data set with respect to determining the total number of people who have held head coaching positions in the NFL from 1963-2018. This study also contains data regarding NFL offensive coordinator, defensive coordinator and general manager demographics as well as tenure and mobility patterns from the start of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012)<sup>5</sup> to kickoff at Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018). This study also highlights mobility patterns of head coaches, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers during the approximate one-year period from the day following Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017) to kickoff at Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018). A specific emphasis is placed on the occupational mobility patterns of offensive coordinators and defensive coordinators because these two positions have historically functioned as the primary occupational pipelines for NFL head coach hires.<sup>6</sup> This study also spotlights additional key head coach "pipeline positions" such as quarterbacks coach, linebackers coach and defensive backs (secondary) coach.

A comprehensive database of descriptive data was developed to analyze the career paths, organizational tenure and occupational mobility patterns of current NFL position coaches in conjunction with examining opportunities for these position coaches to earn promotions to coordinator or head coach positions. In addition, this study integrates descriptive data from recent relevant research conducted by the NFL related to occupational mobility and job success determinants of NFL head coaches.

Researchers verified the number of vacancies filled and individual separations, trajectories and occupational patterns of NFL head coaches, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers based on data provided by the NFL. For example, if an individual was a head coach for multiple NFL teams, this study counts that coach one time in the data set because this study focuses on an analysis of access, opportunity and coaching mobility (i.e., the number of individuals who have held head coach positions) instead of the total number of head coach vacancies from 1963-2018. This analytical framework was also applied to the occupational mobility patterns of offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers from 2012-2018.

The next section of this report presents the findings and results related to an extensive descriptive analysis on the occupational mobility patterns of more than 350 current and former NFL head coaches, general managers, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and position coaches.

<sup>\*5.</sup> This NFL Diversity & Inclusion research report series began analyzing data on occupational mobility patterns commencing at the start of the 2012 NFL regular season.

<sup>\*6.</sup> Findings in the current research study demonstrate that 24 out of the 42 head coaches hired since the start of the 2012 NFL regular season were previously an offensive coordinator in the NFL before earning a head coach opportunity. Fourteen of the 42 head coaches hired since the start of the 2012 NFL regular season were previously a defensive coordinator in the NFL before earning a head coach opportunity.

## FINDINGS AND RESULTS

Between February 6, 2017 (day following Super Bowl LI) and February 4, 2018 (day of Super Bowl LII), NFL teams hired a total of 45 head coaches, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers for open positions. White individuals were hired for 38 of these 45 available positions. Only seven different men of color were hired for these 45 positions. In addition, during this same time period 35 of the 47 head coaches, offensive coordinators, defensive who were fired, resigned, promoted, retired or otherwise "mutually parted ways" with an NFL team were White individuals.

Tables 1–4 and Figures 1–5 provide a summary overview of key findings and results of the research study. The remainder of this section expands on the quantitative findings highlighted in Tables 1–4 and Figures 1–5. In addition, this section presents additional findings with respect to the occupational mobility patterns of select NFL position coaches.

## HEAD COACH CAREER PIPELINES & MULTIPLE HEAD COACH OPPORTUNITIES

TEAM	Name of Former Head Coach	Race of Former Head Coach	Next Opportunity for Former Head Coach	Name of New Head Coach	Race of New Head Coach	Previous Position of New Head Coach
Arizona Cardinals	Bruce Arians	White	Retirement	Steve Wilks	African American	Defensive Coordinator, Carolina Panthers
Chicago Bears	John Fox	White	[no new position]	Matt Nagy	White	Offensive Coordinator, Kansas City Chiefs
Detroit Lions	Jim Caldwell	African American	[no new position]	Matt Patricia	White	Defensive Coordinator, New England Patriots
Indianapolis Colts	Chuck Pagano	White	[no new position]	Frank Reich	White	Offensive Coordinator, Philadelphia Eagles
New York Giants	Ben McAdoo	White	[no new position]	Pat Shurmur	White	Offensive Coordinator, Minnesota Vikings
Oakland Raiders	Jack Del Rio	White	[no new position]	Jon Gruden	White	Football Analyst, ESPN
Tennessee Titans	Mike Mularkey	White	[no new position]	Mike Vrabel	White	Defensive Coordinator, Houston Texans

## Table 1: HEAD COACH MOBILITY PATTERNS (2017-2018)\*

#### \*DATE RANGE FOR DATA: FEBRUARY 6, 2017 (DAY FOLLOWING SUPER BOWL LI) TO FEBRUARY 4, 2018 (DATE OF SUPER BOWL LII)

\* Note: Kyle Shanahan was named head coach of the San Francisco 49ers on February 6, 2017. This position was included in the data for the Volume VI report (2017) at the request of the NFL even though Shanahan was hired the day after Super Bowl LI, which took place on February 5, 2017.

As the above Table 1 illustrates, between February 6, 2017 (day following Super Bowl LI) and February 4, 2018 (day of Super Bowl LII), NFL teams hired six White head coaches. During that same time period, NFL teams hired one head coach of color. In addition, between the start of the 2012 NFL season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), NFL teams hired 35 White head coaches. During that same time period, NFL teams hired seven head coaches of color. Five of these head coaches of color remain current NFL head coaches; Lovie Smith served as head coach of the Tampa Bay Buccaneers during the 2014-2015 NFL seasons, and Jim Caldwell served as head coach of the Detroit Lions from 2014-2017.

Seven current NFL head coaches have been hired since Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017). Five of these seven head coaches are first time NFL head coaches (Matt Nagy, Matt Patricia, Frank Reich, Mike Vrabel and Steve Wilks). Two of the seven recently hired NFL head coaches have prior NFL head coaching experience. New Oakland Raiders head coach Jon Gruden previously served as head coach of the Oakland Raiders from 1998-2001 in addition to serving as head coach of the Tampa Bay Buccaneers from 2002-2008. In addition, recently named New York Giants head coach Pat Shurmur previously served as head coach of the Cleveland Browns from 2011-2012.

Three of the seven recently hired head coaches (Matt Nagy, Frank Reich and Pat Shurmur) were most recently offensive coordinators of another NFL team. Overall, four of the seven recently hired head coaches (Jon Gruden, Matt Nagy, Frank Reich and Pat Shurmur) have previous experience as an NFL offensive coordinator.<sup>7</sup> Three of the seven recently hired head coaches (Matt Patricia, Mike Vrabel and Steve Wilks) were most recently defensive coordinators of another NFL team. Jon Gruden was most recently a football analyst with ESPN before becoming the new head coach of the Oakland Raiders.

It is important to note that, as of February 2018, none of the seven head coaches that were fired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL season (or who retired after the season) had accepted a new coaching-related position within the NFL. This data finding is divergent from occupational mobility patterns observed in previous years. For example, several of the NFL head coaches that were fired during or shortly after the 2016 NFL season (or who retired after the season) subsequently received a new coaching opportunity in a key pipeline position. For instance, Gus Bradley was named defensive coordinator of the Los Angeles Chargers and Mike McCoy was named offensive coordinator of the Denver Broncos.



Figure 1: NFL OPPORTUNITY AFTER FIRST HEAD COACH POSITION (1963-2018)

As illustrated above in Figure 1, after separating from a first head coach position, ten different coaches of color (48% of the 21 total head coaches of color from 1963-2018) have received (and accepted) a second head coach opportunity in the NFL since 1963. After separating from a first head coach position, 54 White individuals have received (and accepted) a second head coach opportunity since 1963. For example, Pat Shurmur recently earned a second head coach opportunity with the New York Giants.





As illustrated above in Figure 2, after separating from a second head coach position, only one coach of color, Tom Flores, has received (and accepted) a third opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team. Fifteen White coaches have received (and accepted) a third opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team. For example, in January 2018 Jon Gruden was named head coach of the Oakland Raiders. This is Gruden's second head coach stint with the Raiders and third overall head coach opportunity; Gruden previously served as

<sup>\*7.</sup> Jon Gruden served as offensive coordinator of the Philadelphia Eagles from 1995-1997

head coach of the Oakland Raiders (1998-2001) and Tampa Bay Buccaneers (2002-2008). In addition, two White coaches (Bill Parcells and Marty Schottenheimer) earned a fourth opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team. Not a single person of color has earned a fourth opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team.



Figure 3: NFL OPPORTUNITY AFTER FIRST HEAD COACH POSITION (2012-2018)

As illustrated above in Figure 3, between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), eight White individuals and three African American individuals received a second head coach opportunity after separating (that is, being fired or promoted, resigning, retiring or otherwise "parting ways") from a first head coach position during this time period. For example, Pat Shurmur was recently named head coach of the New York Giants after previously serving as head coach of the Cleveland Browns (2011-2012). John Fox, Mike Mularkey, and Jon Gruden are the only three coaches who received a third NFL head coach opportunity during this same time period. In addition, one individual (Jim Harbaugh) received a head coach opportunity at the college level after separating from his first NFL head coach position, and two individuals (Lovie Smith and Chip Kelly) received a head coach opportunity at the college level after separating from a second NFL head coach position.

During this same time period between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), eight White individuals and two African American individuals received an opportunity to be an offensive coordinator after separating from a first head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach Joe Philbin was named offensive coordinator of the Green Bay Packers after previously serving as head coach of the Miami Dolphins (2012-2015). Also, during this same time period, five White individuals and one African American individual received an opportunity to be an NFL defensive coordinator after separating from a first head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach position. In January 2018, former first time NFL head coach Mike Pettine was named new defensive coordinator of the Green Bay Packers.

Findings in the current research study also revealed 18 African American individuals have been head coaches in the NFL since 1963.<sup>8</sup> Seven African American individuals have held interim head coach positions (i.e., these individuals were head coaches for a part of an NFL season) but were not offered the head coach position for the following full NFL season. In January 2015, Todd Bowles became the first African American leader named to a head coach position after previously serving as an interim head coach earlier in his career; Bowles served as interim head coach for three games with the Miami Dolphins during the 2011-2012 NFL season. In January 2017, Anthony Lynn became the second African American leader named to a head coach position after previously serving as an interim head coach earlier in his career; Lynn served as interim head coach for one game with the Buffalo Bills during the 2016-2017 NFL season.

In addition, only eight NFL teams have hired two different African American head coaches from 1963-2018. For example, in January 2018 Steve Wilks became the second African American head coach in the history of the Arizona Cardinals; Dennis Green was the head coach of the Cardinals from 2004-2006. Similarly, in January 2016 Hue Jackson became the second African American head coach in the history of the Cleveland Browns; Romeo Crennel was the head coach of the Cleveland Browns from 2005-2008. Also, with the hiring of Lovie Smith in 2014, the Tampa Bay Buccaneers became the first NFL team to hire three African American head coaches (Tony Dungy, Raheem Morris and Lovie Smith). The Buccaneers fired Smith in January 2016. In addition, the Indianapolis Colts became the first (and only) NFL team to hire African American head coaches back-to-back when the Colts hired Jim Caldwell to succeed Tony Dungy in 2009.

<sup>\*8.</sup> Based on internal NFL research data, NFL teams hired 80 head coaches during the previous twelve-year period from 2006-2017. Only twelve of these 80 head coach vacancies (15%) were filled by men of color.

# OFFENSIVE AND DEFENSIVE COORDINATOR MOBILITY PATTERNS, AND COORDINATOR CAREER OPPORTUNITIES FOLLOWING NFL HEAD COACH EXPERIENCE

TEAM	Name of Former Offensive Coordinator	Race of Former Offensive Coordinator	Next Opportunity for Former Offensive Coordinator	Name of New Offensive Coordinator	Race of New Offensive Coordinator	Previous Position of New Offensive Coordinator
Arizona Cardinals	Harold Goodwin	African American	[no new position]	Mike McCoy	White	Offensive Coordinator, Denver Broncos
Buffalo Bills	Rick Dennison	White	Offensive Line Coach/ Run Game Coordinator New York Jets	Brian Daboll	White	Offensive Coordinator & Quarterbacks Coach, University of Alabama
Carolina Panthers	Mike Shula	White	Offensive Coordinator, New York Giants	Norv Turner	White	Offensive Coordinator, Minnesota Vikings (2014-2016)
Chicago Bears	Dowell Loggains	White	Offensive Coordinator, Miami Dolphins	Mark Helfrich	White	Football Analyst, Fox Sports; Head Coach, University of Oregon (2013-2016)
Cincinnati Bengals	Ken Zampese	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Cleveland Browns	Bill Lazor	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Cincinnati Bengals
Cleveland Browns	[no offensive coordinator]	[not applicable]	[no new position]	Todd Haley	White	Offensive Coordinator, Pittsburgh Steelers
Denver Broncos	Mike McCoy	White	Offensive Coordinator, Arizona Cardinals	Bill Musgrave	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Denver Broncos
Green Bay Packers	Edgar Bennett	African American	Wide Receivers Coach, Oakland Raiders	Joe Philbin	White	Assistant Head Coach & Offensive Line Coach, Indianapolis Colts
Kansas City Chiefs	Matt Nagy	White	Head Coach, Chicago Bears	Eric Bieniemy	African American	Running Backs Coach, Kansas City Chiefs
Indianapolis Colts	Rob Chudzinski	White	[no new position]	Nick Sirianni	White	Wide Receivers Coach, Los Angeles Chargers
Los Angeles Rams	Matt LaFleur	White	Offensive Coordinator, Tennessee Titans	(not applicable)+	[not applicable]	[not applicable]
Miami Dolphins	Clyde Christensen	White	Director of Football & Player Development, Miami Dolphins	Dowell Loggains	White	Offensive Coordinator, Chicago Bears
Minnesota Vikings	Pat Shurmur	White	Head Coach, New York Giants	John DeFilippo	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Philadelphia Eagles

## Table 2: OFFENSIVE COORDINATOR MOBILITY PATTERNS (2017-2018)\*

(Continued on next page)

New York Giants	Mike Sullivan	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Denver Broncos	Mike Shula	White	Offensive Coordinator, Carolina Panthers
New York Jets	John Morton	White	[no new position]	Jeremy Bates	White	Quarterbacks Coach, New York Jets
Oakland Raiders	Todd Downing	White	Senior Offensive Assistant, Minnesota Vikings	Greg Olson	White	Quarterbacks Coach, Los Angeles Rams
						Wide Receivers
Philadelphia	Frank Reich	ch White	Head Coach, Indianapolis Colts	Mike Groh	White	Coach,
Eagles						Philadelphia Eagles
Pittsburgh	Todd Holoy	Todd Haley White	Offensive	Randy Fichtner	White	Quarterbacks Coach,
Steelers	Todd Haley	White	Coordinator, Cleveland Browns	Ranuy Fichther	White	Pittsburgh Steelers
Seattle	Darrell Bevell	White	[no new position]	Brian Schottenheimer	White	Quarterbacks Coach,
Seahawks				Schottermeimer		Indianapolis Colts
Tennessee Titans	Terry Robiskie Africar America	African	Wide Receivers Coach,	Matt LaFleur	White	Offensive Coordinator,
		, American	American	Buffalo Bills		

## \* DATE RANGE FOR DATA: FEBRUARY 7, 2017 (DAY FOLLOWING SUPER BOWL 51) TO FEBRUARY 4, 2018 (DATE OF SUPER BOWL LII)

\* Note: At the request of the NFL, offensive coordinator openings and subsequent hires for the Los Angeles Rams and San Francisco 49ers were included in the Volume VI report (2017) because each of these two offensive coordinator positions were open (but not yet filled) prior to kickoff at Super Bowl LI.

+ Note: Los Angeles Rams head coach Sean McVay will once again be responsible for calling plays on offense.

## Table 3: DEFENSIVE COORDINATOR MOBILITY PATTERNS (2017-2018)\*

TEAM	Name of Former Defensive Coordinator	Race of Former Defensive Coordinator	Next Opportunity for Former Defensive Coordinator	Name of New Defensive Coordinator	Race of New Defensive Coordinator	Previous Position of New Defensive Coordinator
Arizona Cardinals	James Bettcher	White	Defensive Coordinator, New York Giants	Al Holcomb	African American	Linebackers Coach, Carolina Panthers
Baltimore Ravens	Dean Pees	White	Defensive Coordinator, Tennessee Titans	Don Martindale	White	Linebackers Coach, Baltimore Ravens
Carolina Panthers	Steve Wilks	African American	Head Coach, Arizona Cardinals	Eric Washington	African American	Defensive Line Coach, Carolina Panthers
Cincinnati Bengals	Paul Guenther	White	Defensive Coordinator, Oakland Raiders	Teryl Austin	African American	Defensive Coordinator, Detroit Lions
Detroit Lions	Teryl Austin	African American	Defensive Coordinator, Cincinnati Bengals	Paul Pasqualoni	White	Defensive Line Coach, Boston College
Green Bay Packers	Dom Capers	White	[no new position]	Mike Pettine	White	Consultant, Seattle Seahawks
Houston Texans	Mike Vrabel	White	Head Coach, Tennessee Titans	Romeo Crennel	African American	Assistant Head Coach—Defense, Houston Texans

Indianapolis Colts	Ted Monachino	White	[no new position]	Matt Eberflus	White	Linebackers Coach, Dallas Cowboys
New England Patriots	Matt Patricia	White	Head Coach, Detroit Lions	[not applicable]	[not applicable]	[not applicable]
New York Giants	Steve Spagnuolo	White	[no new position]	James Bettcher	White	Defensive Coordinator, Arizona Cardinals
Oakland Raiders	Ken Norton Jr.+	African American	Defensive Coordinator, Seattle Seahawks	Paul Guenther	White	Defensive Coordinator, Cincinnati Bengals
Seattle Seahawks	Kris Richard	African American	Defensive Backs Coach and Defensive Passing Game Coordinator, Dallas Cowboys	Ken Norton Jr.	African American	Defensive Coordinator, Oakland Raiders
Tennessee Titans	Dick LeBeau	White	[no new position]	Dean Pees	White	Defensive Coordinator, Baltimore Ravens

#### \* DATE RANGE FOR DATA: FEBRUARY 6, 2017 (DAY FOLLOWING SUPER BOWL LI) TO FEBRUARY 4, 2018 (DATE OF SUPER BOWL LII)

\* Note: At the request of the NFL, the San Francisco 49ers and Atlanta Falcons defensive coordinator openings and subsequent hires were included in the Volume VI report (2017) even though these defensive coordinator openings were not officially filled prior to kickoff at Super Bowl LI (February 5, 2017).

+ Note: Ken Norton Jr. initially accepted the assistant head coach—defense/inside linebackers position with the San Francisco 49ers approximately one week before being named the new defensive coordinator of the Seattle Seahawks.

^ Note: The New England Patriots did not hire a new defensive coordinator during the data collection period for this report.

As the above **Tables 2** and **3** illustrate, between February 6, 2017 (day following Super Bowl LI) and February 4, 2018 (day of Super Bowl LII), NFL teams hired 18 White offensive coordinators and one offensive coordinator of color. During the same approximate one-year time period, NFL teams hired seven White defensive coordinators and five defensive coordinators of color. Between the start of the 2012 NFL season (September 5, 2012 and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), NFL teams hired 71 White offensive coordinators and eight offensive coordinators of color. During that same time period, NFL teams hired 40 White defensive coordinators and 24 defensive coordinators of color.

Four of the 19 offensive coordinators hired between the day after Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018) are currently holding an NFL offensive coordinator position for the fourth or greater time (Brian Daboll, Bill Musgrave, Greg Olson and Norv Turner). Five of the 19 offensive coordinators hired during this time period are serving as an NFL offensive coordinator for the third time (Todd Haley, Dowell Loggains, Mike McCoy, Brian Schottenheimer and Mike Shula). Five offensive coordinators hired during this time period are serving as an NFL offensive coordinator for the second time (Jeremy Bates, John DeFilippo, Matt LaFleur, Bill Lazor and Joe Philbin). The remaining five offensive coordinators were hired as first time NFL offensive coordinators (Eric Bieniemy, Randy Fichtner, Mike Groh, Mark Helfrich and Nick Sirianni); fourteen of the 19 recently hired offensive coordinators hired between the day following Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017) and kickoff at Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018) held the offensive coordinator position with an NFL team immediately before being named offensive coordinator of their current NFL team. In addition, seven of the 19 offensive coordinators hired between the day after Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018) held the quarterbacks coach position with an NFL team immediately before being named offensive coordinator of their current NFL team.

Three of the 12 defensive coordinators hired between the day after Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017) and kickoff at Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018) are currently holding an NFL defensive coordinator position for the third or greater time (Romeo Crennel, Dean Pees and Mike Pettine). Six of the 12 defensive coordinators hired during this time period are serving as an NFL defensive coordinator for the second time (Teryl Austin, James Bettcher, Paul Guenther, Don Martindale, Ken Norton Jr. and Paul Pasqualoni). The remaining three defensive coordinators are first time NFL defensive coordinators (Matt Eberflus, Al Holcomb and Eric Washington). Five of the 12 defensive coordinators hired between the day after Super Bowl LI (February 6, 2017) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018) held the defensive coordinator position with an NFL team immediately before being named defensive coordinator of their current NFL team.

As illustrated above in Figure 1 of this report, after separating from a first head coach position, 27 White individuals have held offensive coordinator positions and 26 White individuals have held defensive coordinator positions since 1963. For example, Joe Philbin was recently named offensive coordinator of the Green Bay Packers after previously serving as head coach of the Miami Dolphins (2012-2015). In addition, Mike Pettine was recently named defensive coordinator of the Green Bay Packers after previously serving as head coach of the Green Bay Packers after previously serving as head coach of the Green Bay Packers after previously serving as head coach of the Cleveland Browns (2014-2015). After separating from a first head coach position, three coaches of color (Tom Fears, Jim Caldwell and Hue Jackson) have held the offensive coordinator position and two coaches of color (Romeo Crennel and Leslie Frazier) have been defensive coordinators.



#### Figure 4: NFL OFFENSIVE COORDINATOR MOBILITY PATTERNS (2012-2018)

Figure 5: NFL DEFENSIVE COORDINATOR MOBILITY PATTERNS (2012-2018)



As illustrated above in Figure 4 and Figure 5, between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), 33 White individuals have received a second opportunity to work as an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team. During this same time period, only five men of color received a similar "second-chance" opportunity to be an offensive coordinator. In addition, during this same time period, 41 White individuals received a "third or greater chance" to work as an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team, whereas only ten men of color received a similar "third or greater chance" to be an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator or defensive coordinator or defensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team, whereas only ten men of color received a similar "third or greater chance" to be an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator.

## GENERAL MANAGER MOBILITY PATTERNS

## Table 4: GENERAL MANAGER MOBILITY PATTERNS (2017-2018)

TEAM	Name of Former General Manager	Race of Former General Manager	Next Opportunity for Former General Manager	Name of New General Manager	Race of New General Manager	Previous Position of New General Manager
Buffalo Bills	Doug Whaley	African American	Entrepreneur, Impellia	Brandon Beane	White	Assistant General Manager, Carolina Panthersrs
Carolina Panthers	Dave Gettleman	White	General Manager, New York Giants	Marty Hurney	White	Interim General Manager, Carolina Panthers
Cleveland Browns	Sashi Brown^	African American	[no new position]	John Dorsey	White	General Manager, Kansas City Chiefs
Green Bay Packers	Ted Thompson	White	Senior Advisor to Football Operations, Green Bay Packers	Brian Gutekunst	White	Director of Player Personnel, Green Bay Packers
Houston Texans	Rick Smith*	African American	[leave of absence from team/ position]	Brian Gaine	White	Vice President of Player Personnel, Buffalo Bills
Kansas City Chiefs	John Dorsey	White	General Manager, Cleveland Browns	Brett Veach	White	Co-Director of Player Personnel, Kansas City Chiefs
New York Giants	Jerry Reese	African American	[no new position]	Dave Gettleman	White	General Manager, Carolina Panthers
Washington Redskins	Scot McCloughan	White	Entrepreneur, Instinctive Scouting	[team decided not to hire a new general manager]+	(not applicable]	[not applicable]

#### \* DATE RANGE FOR DATA: FEBRUARY 6, 2017 (DAY FOLLOWING SUPER BOWL LI) TO FEBRUARY 4, 2018 (DATE OF SUPER BOWL LII)

- Note: In January 2016, the Cleveland Browns promoted Sashi Brown, an African American executive, from general counsel executive vice president of football operations. The Browns also named former New York Mets baseball operations executive Paul DePodesta to the newly created position of Chief Strategy Officer. The Browns subsequently hired Andrew Berry, an African American individual, as the team's new vice president of player personnel. Berry reported to DePodesta and Brown. Although the Browns decided not to hire a new general manager, Brown essentially functioned as the team's general manager.
- \* Note: In January 2018, Rick Smith announced he would be taking an extended leave of absence from the Houston Texans to care for his wife who has been battling breast cancer. Smith plans to return to the Texans. During his leave of absence, Smith will retain his title of Executive Vice President. However, the Texans decided to hire a new general manager in his absence.
- + Note: In June 2017, Washington promoted Doug Williams, an African American, to the position of Senior Vice President of Player Personnel. Washington decided not to hire a new general manager.

As the above **Table 4** illustrates, between February 6, 2017 (day following Super Bowl LI) and February 4, 2018 (day of Super Bowl LII), NFL teams hired seven White general managers. During that same time period, four general managers of color were fired or replaced whereas NFL teams hired zero new general managers of color. Between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), NFL teams hired 25 general managers; twenty-three of the 25 general managers (92%) hired during this timeframe are White individuals. Ray Farmer, who is African American, was hired as general manager of the Cleveland Browns in February 2014. In addition, Chris Grier, who is African American, was hired as general manager of the Miami Dolphins in January 2016.

# NFL POSITION COACHES— EXAMINING THE PRIMARY PIPELINES FOR ASPIRING HEAD COACH CANDIDATES

**Quarterbacks Coaches:** As of February 2018, only two quarterbacks coaches were African American individuals (Byron Leftwich and David Culley). Leftwich and Culley were both hired as first time NFL quarterbacks coaches in January 2017. Twelve current NFL offensive coordinators worked as an NFL quarterbacks coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. In addition, eight current NFL quarterbacks coaches have previously worked as an NFL offensive coordinator, and one current NFL quarterbacks coach (Josh McDaniels) previously served as an NFL head coach.

**Running Backs Coaches:** As of February 2018, twenty-seven NFL running backs coaches were African American individuals and one running backs coach was an American Samoan individual (Kennedy Polamalu). When Eric Bieniemy was named offensive coordinator of the Kansas City Chiefs in January 2018, he became the only current NFL offensive coordinator that worked as an NFL running backs coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. Nine of the 27 African American running backs coaches have held that coaching position for at least three NFL seasons; the average stint/tenure for current African American running backs coaches is 2.3 years. In addition, two of the 27 African American running backs coaches (John Morton and Curtis Modkins) have previously worked as an NFL offensive coordinator. No current NFL running backs coache are currently serving in that position for a second or greater time.

**Wide Receivers Coaches:** As of February 2018, seventeen NFL wide receivers coaches were African American individuals. The average stint/tenure for current wide receivers coaches of color is 1.3 years. In addition, only two current NFL offensive coordinators (recently hired Mike Groh and Nick Sirianni) worked as an NFL wide receivers coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. Two of the 17 current wide receivers coaches of color (Terry Robiskie and Edgar Bennett) previously served as an NFL offensive coordinator. Raheem Morris is the only current African American wide receivers coache who has previous NFL head coach experience. Also, 17 current NFL wide receivers coaches are currently serving in that position for a second or greater time.

**Tight Ends Coaches:** As of February 2018, six NFL tight ends coaches were African American individuals. The average stint/tenure for current African American tight ends coaches is 5.5 years. No current NFL offensive coordinator worked as an NFL tight ends coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. In addition, none of the six current African American tight ends coaches previously served as an NFL offensive coordinator, as compared with five of the current White tight ends coaches who have previously worked as an NFL offensive coordinator.

**Offensive Line Coaches:** As of February 2018, one NFL offensive line coach (recently hired Ray Brown) is an African American. Only one current NFL offensive coordinator (Joe Philbin) worked as an NFL offensive line coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. Seven of the current White offensive line coaches have previously worked as an NFL offensive coordinator; in addition, 25 current NFL offensive line coaches are currently serving in that position for a second or greater time.

**Defensive Line Coaches:** As of February 2018, fourteen NFL defensive line coaches were African American individuals. The average stint/tenure for current African American defensive line coaches is 1 year. Four current NFL defensive coordinators (Rod Marinelli, Kacy Rodgers, Todd Wash and Eric Washington) worked as an NFL defensive line coach immediately prior to earning an opportunity to work as an NFL defensive coordinator. In addition, none of the 14 current African American defensive line coaches have previously held an NFL defensive coordinator position. Twenty-one current NFL defensive line coaches are currently serving in that position for a second or greater time.<sup>9</sup>

**Linebackers Coaches:** As of February 2018, eight NFL linebackers coaches were African American individuals. The average stint/tenure for current African American linebackers coaches is two years. Eight current NFL defensive coordinators (five White defensive coordinators, two African American defensive coordinators, and one Muslim American defensive coordinator) worked as an NFL linebackers coach

<sup>\*9.</sup> In addition, one of the seven NFL head coaches hired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL regular season is a third time NFL head coach. Jon Gruden previously coached the Oakland Raiders (1998-2001) and Tampa Bay Buccaneers (2002-2008) to a combined 95-81 record.

immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL defensive coordinator. In addition, five current White linebackers coaches have previously worked as an NFL defensive coordinator, as compared with one African American linebackers coach (Frank Bush) who has previously worked as an NFL defensive coordinator. Eighteen current NFL linebackers coaches are currently serving in that position for a second or greater time.

**Defensive Backs Coaches:** As of February 2018, twenty-one NFL defensive backs (secondary) coaches were African American individuals. The average stint/tenure for current African American defensive backs (secondary) coaches is 1.6 years. Three current NFL defensive coordinators (Leslie Frazier, Marquand Manuel and Joe Woods) worked as an NFL defensive backs (secondary) coach immediately prior to earning the opportunity to work as an NFL defensive coordinator.

The above data indicate that the quarterbacks coach position is one of the primary occupational mobility pipelines to work as an NFL offensive coordinator. The above data also indicate linebackers and defensive backs (secondary) coach positions function as two primary occupational mobility pipelines to work as an NFL defensive coordinator.

## ADDITIONAL KEY RESEARCH FINDINGS

#### **Based on NFL Internal Data Collection & Analysis**

Internal research by the NFL league office found that first time NFL coaches hired during the eleven-year period between 2006-2016 who had less than five years of coordinator experience succeeded at a rate of 19% (that is, six of the 31 coaches had a career coaching record above .500 or coached in the playoffs more than once). This NFL research study also found that first time NFL coaches hired between 2006-2016 who had five or more years of coordinator experience succeeded at a rate of 73% (that is, 11 of the 15 coaches had a career coaching record above .500 or coaches had a career coaching record above .500

Six current NFL head coaches were hired between the day following Super Bowl 50 (February 8, 2016) and kickoff at Super Bowl LI (February 5, 2017). Five of these six head coaches are first time NFL head coaches (Vance Joseph, Anthony Lynn, Sean McVay, Sean McDermott, and Kyle Shanahan). Only one of the six NFL head coaches hired during this same time period (Doug Marrone) had prior NFL head coaching experience. Current Jacksonville Jaguars head coach Doug Marrone previously served as head coach of the Buffalo Bills during the 2013-2014 NFL seasons.

Three of the five first time head coaches hired between the day following Super Bowl 50 (February 8, 2016) and kickoff at Super Bowl LI (February 5, 2017) had three years or less of NFL coordinator experience (Joseph, Lynn, and McVay) before earning the opportunity to coach an NFL team. Shanahan and McDermott each had at least eight years of previous NFL coordinator experience before becoming an NFL head coach. Based on the recent research by the NFL league office discussed above, Shanahan and McDermott were better prepared and positioned to succeed as first time NFL head coaches as compared with Joseph, Lynn and McVay as a result of Shanahan's and McDermott's extensive prior experience as NFL coordinators. During the 2017 NFL regular season, the three teams coached by Joseph (Broncos: 5-11 record), Lynn (Chargers: 9-7 record) and McVay (Rams: 11-5 record) combined for 25 wins and 23 losses (52% combined winning percentage); McVay coached the Rams to the playoffs. Conversely, during the 2017 NFL regular season, the two teams coached by Shanahan (49ers: 6-10 record) and McDermott (Bills: 9-7 record) combined for 15 wins and 17 losses (47% combined winning percentage); McDermott coached the Bills to the playoffs.

Three of the four first time head coaches recently hired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL regular season had three years or less of NFL coordinator experience (Nagy, Vrabel and Wilks) before earning the opportunity to coach an NFL team. Patricia spent six years as defensive coordinator of the New England Patriots before earning his first NFL head coach opportunity. Again, based on the recent research by the NFL league office discussed above, Patricia is better prepared and positioned to succeed as a first time NFL head coach as compared with Nagy, Vrabel and Wilks as a result of Patricia's extensive prior experience as an NFL defensive coordinator.

Recent research by the NFL league office also found that, during the eleven-year period between 2006-2016, second time head coaches who had winning records during their first stint as an NFL head coach succeeded at a rate of 45%. Conversely, second time head coaches who had losing records during their first stint as an NFL head coach only succeeded at a rate of 33%.

One of the six NFL head coaches hired during or shortly after the 2016 NFL regular season is a second time NFL head coach. Doug Marrone, current head coach of the Jacksonville Jaguars, previously coached the Buffalo Bills to a combined 15-17 record during the 2013-2014 NFL regular seasons. The recent NFL research

discussed above forecasted a 33% success rate for Marrone in his leadership role as new head coach of the Jacksonville Jaguars. Nonetheless, Marrone coached the Jaguars to a 10-6 record during the 2017 NFL regular season; the Jaguars also won two playoff games in order to advance to the AFC championship game.

One of the seven NFL head coaches hired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL regular season is a second time NFL head coach.<sup>10</sup> Pat Shurmur, recently named new head coach of the New York Giants, previously coached the Cleveland Browns to a combined 9-23 record during the 2011-2012 NFL regular seasons. The recent NFL research discussed above predicts a 33% success rate for Shurmur in his new head coach position.

# DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS: PRACTICAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

#### "The Reshuffling Effect"—Limiting the Talent Pipeline

Findings in the current research study indicate 14 of the 19 recently hired offensive coordinators previously served at least one prior stint as an NFL offensive coordinator; in addition, nine of the 12 recently hired defensive coordinators have previously served as an NFL defensive coordinator. Findings in the current research study also indicate 24 out of the 42 head coaches hired since the start of the 2012 NFL regular season were previously an offensive coordinator in the NFL before earning a head coach opportunity. Fourteen of the 42 head coaches hired since the start of the 2012 NFL regular season were previously a defensive coordinator in the NFL before earning indicate that the offensive coordinator in the NFL before earning indicate that the offensive coordinator position is historically (but not always) the primary pipeline for aspiring first time NFL head coaches, whereas defensive coordinator can be viewed as the next most viable pipeline for prospective first time NFL head coaches. Rider et al. (2016) studied head coach changes from 1985-2012 and found that approximately 70% of all head coach promotions involved coaches who were promoted from a coordinator position.

For example, six out of the seven head coaches hired between February 2, 2014 and February 1, 2015 had defensive coaching backgrounds (Bowles, Del Rio, Fox, Quinn, Tomsula and Ryan) as compared with only one coach with an offensive coaching background (Kubiak). Conversely, all seven head coaches hired between February 2, 2015 and kickoff at Super Bowl 50 (February 7, 2016) had offensive coaching backgrounds; six of these seven head coaches had previous experience as an NFL offensive coordinator, and five of these seven head coaches were NFL offensive coordinators immediately prior to earning that head coach opportunity.

The Volume VI research report (2017) extended this data set on the impact and importance of NFL coordinat as offensive coordinators and three as defensive coordinators).

Findings in this research study once again reveal a troubling "reshuffling effect" in which recently "separated" (i.e., promoted, fired, resigned, retired or otherwise parted ways) head coaches, offensive coordinators and defensive coordinators immediately received a new coaching opportunity in a key "head coach pipeline position" such as quarterbacks coach, linebackers coach and defensive backs (secondary) coach. For example, two of the nineteen recently separated offensive coordinators subsequently received an opportunity to be the quarterbacks coach of an NFL team. In addition, seven of the nineteen recently hired offensive coordinators were most recently an NFL guarterbacks coach before being named to their current offensive coordinator position; four of these seven former quarterbacks coaches received an internal promotion to offensive coordinator of the same team. Overall, fourteen of the nineteen recently hired offensive coordinators have prior quarterbacks coach experience at the NFL level. Also, five of the recently separated offensive coordinators made a lateral career move with respect to being named an offensive coordinator of a different NFL team. On the defensive side, nine of the twelve recently hired defensive coordinators have prior experience as a linebackers coach in the NFL. Several of the recently separated defensive coordinators immediately received a new coaching opportunity in a key "head coach pipeline position." For example, five of the recently separated defensive coordinators made a lateral career move with respect to being named a defensive coordinator of a different NFL team.

Recent research by the NFL league office revealed 25 out of 80 (32.5%) NFL head coaches hired during the twelve-year period from 2006-2017 were former NFL head coaches. Four of these 25 "second or greater opportunity" head coaches hired during this twelve-year period were men of color. These findings demonstrate that in order to be hired as a head coach in the NFL oftentimes the perceived most valuable career background is previous experience as an NFL head coach. These findings demonstrate another instance of the reshuffling effect with respect to limiting the overall number of opportunities for prospective first time NFL head coaches.

<sup>\*10.</sup> In addition, one of the seven NFL head coaches hired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL regular season is a third time NFL head coach Jon Gruden previously coached the Oakland Raiders (1998-2001) and Tampa Bay Buccaneers (2002-2008) to a combined 95-81 record.

Findings in this Volume VII research report also indicate a prevalence of the reshuffling effect with respect to the same individuals repeatedly hired for NFL team coordinator positions, which prevents new talent from entering key head coach pipelines. For example, between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), seventy-four White individuals have received at least a second opportunity to work as an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team. Only fifteen men of color have received a similar "second or greater" opportunity during the same time period; twelve of the fifteen "second or greater chances" have been for men of color hired as defensive coordinators. Thirty-three White individuals have received a second opportunity to work as an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team between the beginning of the 2012 NFL regular season (September 5, 2012) and Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018). During this same time period, only five men of color received a similar "second-chance" opportunity to be an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator. During this same time period, 41 White individuals received a "third or greater chance" to work as an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator of an NFL team, whereas only ten men of color received a similar "third or greater chance" to be an offensive coordinator or defensive coordinator. While it is somewhat encouraging that 37.5% (24 out of 64) of the defensive coordinators hired since the start of the 2012 NFL regular season are coordinators of color, only 10% (8 out of 79) of the offensive coordinators hired during this same time period have been coordinators of color.

#### Social Capital and Implicit Bias—The Importance of Trust and Perceived Competence

In addition to increasing the number of qualified candidates of color who interview for each open coordinator, head coach and general manager position, it is imperative to ensure that these qualified candidates are perceived as qualified by the individuals who make the hiring decisions. A qualified candidate's job prospects will be impacted by intangible factors such as trust and perceived competence in addition to tangible factors such as actual performance in past coaching or coordinator position(s). The findings in the current study reiterate the need to develop and implement bias-lessening processes and procedures with respect to the hiring process for head coaches, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers. The findings in the current study underscore and uncover the complexity of organizational nuances that may influence the final hiring decisions and determine the opportunities for coaches of color, offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators and general managers to maneuver the hierarchies of leadership positions.

The findings of the current study support the power of social capital, as ten out of the twenty-one total head coaches of color from 1963-2018 have earned a second opportunity to be the head coach of an NFL team. The key is to develop strategies and implement practices and processes that provide more candidates of color with a realistic opportunity to be a head coach in the NFL. As explained by scholars such as Kilduff et al. (2016), Day and McDonald (2010), and Sagas and Cunningham (2005), it is imperative to create a systemic approach that facilitates both strong and weak networking ties amongst leadership candidates of color in addition to increasing opportunities for rising industry stars to develop meaningful connections with "higher status" African American and White leaders within NFL teams and at the NFL league office. As explained by Kay et al. (2009), NFL leadership candidates of color "will have to do more than simply overcome the obstacles inherent in how the current social system is structured; they will also have to alter how people think it should be structured" (p. 421-22).

The Rooney Rule may enable a person of color to earn an opportunity to secure an initial head coach or coordinator position, but intangible factors such as trust and perceived competence may have even more of an impact on future occupational mobility (second and third coaching or coordinator opportunities). Rider et al. (2106) expounded, "A decade after the Rooney Rule's implementation, within-job racial disparity clearly persists" (p. 40). Therefore, in addition to working to increase the number of people of color who make hiring decisions (team owners and general managers), it is imperative to work on improving "the perception of competence" of sport business professionals of color (Shropshire, 1996, p. 129-30). Stated differently, even if there is an increase in general managers of color and team owners, negative race consciousness associated with the coaching and coordinating capabilities of candidates of color may still exist and persist (see Shropshire, 1996).

For instance, Day (2015) applied the particularistic mobility thesis to examine race-based occupational mobility differences that result from "subjective aspects of work, such as upper level managers' (mis) perceptions, stereotypes, and biased evaluations of workers' managerial abilities" (p. 25). Day concluded that, "if coaches are hired into executive positions based on their perceived intangible traits (for example, loyalty, leadership abilities, and work effort), in addition to their real or perceived professional experience and

technical expertise, the particularistic manipulation of these traits and skills will likely lead to more numerous and less constricted promotion opportunities for White coaches than for Black coaches" (p. 25).

In a similar recent empirical research study, Day (2018) explained that, historically, African American workers have been more vulnerable to downward occupational mobility because of their segregation into racialized jobs and networks combined with decision makers' cognitive biases and particularistic manipulation of performance criteria and (un)desirable employee characteristics. Day (2018) also noted that "scholars have recommended that employers can overcome such biases through the formalization of the hiring, promotion, and firing process" (p. 11). Developing and implementing additional, formalized processes to complement the existing Rooney Rule requirements might further ensure that all interviewees for open head coach, general manager and coordinator positions are truly provided with a meaningful opportunity during the interview process.

#### Occupational Mobility and Job Tenure—Change as the Consistent Constant

This research study also analyzed the tenure/stint (i.e., length of time in current positions) of all current NFL head coaches, offensive coordinators and defensive coordinators. For current NFL offensive coordinators, the average length of time is only 1 year in the current position. Twenty-five current NFL offensive coordinators have been in their current position for two NFL seasons or fewer. Only four NFL offensive coordinators have been in their current position for three or more NFL seasons (Jim Bob Cooter, Scott Linehan, Pete Carmichael and Josh McDaniels). The data is somewhat similar for defensive coordinators have been in their current position. Twenty-four current NFL defensive coordinators have been in their current position. Twenty-four current NFL defensive coordinators have been in their current position for two or fewer NFL seasons, whereas only eight NFL defensive coordinators have been in their current position for three or more NFL seasons.

As of kickoff at Super Bowl LII (February 4, 2018), only one African American held an offensive coordinator position with an NFL team—Eric Bieniemy was recently named offensive coordinator of the Kansas City Chiefs. However, head coach Andy Reid will be responsible for play calling on offense during the 2018 NFL regular season. Three offensive coordinators of color (Edgar Bennett, Harold Goodwin and Terry Robiskie) were all fired during or shortly after the 2017 NFL regular season.

The average tenure/stint in the current position for the eleven current men of color in defensive coordinator positions is approximately 1 year. Each of the eleven current NFL defensive coordinators of color has four or fewer NFL seasons of experience in his current defensive coordinator position. The Cardinals, Panthers, Bengals, Texans and Seahawks—five NFL teams who recently hired defensive coordinators of color in January/February 2018—had a combined record of 39-41 during the most recently completed 2017 NFL regular season. The combined win/loss record for teams coached by one of the other six current African American defensive coordinators was 48-48 during the 2017 NFL regular season.

The average coach tenure/stint for the eight men of color currently in NFL head coach positions is five years. Steve Wilks was named head coach of the Arizona Cardinals in January 2018. Anthony Lynn was named head coach of the Los Angeles Chargers in January 2017. Vance Joseph was similarly named head coach of the Denver Broncos in January 2017. Hue Jackson now has two NFL season of experience coaching the Cleveland Browns. Todd Bowles now has three NFL seasons of experience coaching the New York Jets. Ron Rivera has been head coach of the Carolina Panthers for seven seasons. Mike Tomlin has been coach of the Pittsburgh Steelers for eleven seasons. And, Marvin Lewis has been head coach of the Cincinnati Bengals for 15 seasons. Hue Jackson was named head coach of a team, the Cleveland Browns, which struggled to a 3-13 record during the 2015 NFL regular season immediately before Jackson was hired. The Browns finished the 2017 NFL regular season with a 0-16 record. The combined win/loss record for teams coached by one of the other seven then-current head coaches of color during the 2017 NFL regular season was 59-53 (.527 winning percentage).

The average coach tenure/stint for the eight men of color currently in NFL head coach positions is 4.5 years. Hue Jackson was named head coach of the Cleveland Browns in January 2016. Todd Bowles now has two NFL seasons of experience coaching the New York Jets. Jim Caldwell has been head coach of the Detroit Lions for three seasons. Ron Rivera has been head coach of the Carolina Panthers for six seasons. Mike Tomlin has been coach of the Pittsburgh Steelers for ten seasons. And, Marvin Lewis has been head coach of the Cincinnati Bengals for 14 seasons. Hue Jackson was named head coach of a team, the Cleveland Browns, which struggled to a 3-13 record during the 2015 NFL regular season. The Browns finished the 2016-2017 NFL regular season with a 1-15 record. The combined win/loss record for teams coached by one of the other five current head coaches of color was 37-42-1 during the 2016-2017 NFL regular season.

#### Sorting, Stacking & Performance-Reward Bias—Access Barriers to Leadership Positions

The above data indicate that coaches of color are often "sorted" and "stacked" into position coach roles such as running backs coaches, wide receivers coaches and defensive line coaches with minimal likelihood of ever earning an opportunity to work as an offensive or defensive coordinator of an NFL team. As discussed above in this report, NFL coordinator experience is often viewed as essential with respect to NFL head coach prospects. All seven recently named head coaches have previous NFL level coordinator experience. The defensive backs (secondary) coach position presently functions as one of the more viable occupational mobility paths for coaches of color in the NFL. For instance, Steve Wilks served as defensive backs (secondary) coach for three different NFL teams (Bears, Chargers and Panthers) before earning an opportunity to serve as the defensive coordinator of the Panthers during the 2017 NFL regular season.

Rider et al. (2016) hypothesized that "stacking" and "sorting" allocative mechanisms directly impact the occupational mobility of people of color and create racial disparities in leadership. As explained by Rider et al. (2016), the "entry point 'sorting' mechanism suggests that racial minorities are initially allocated at hiring to positions with lesser upward mobility prospects than are white employees. The post-entry 'stacking' mechanism implies that racial minorities are allocated to such marginalized positions after hiring" (p. 9). Race-based sorting at the time of hire implies that "racial minorities' first jobs will typically be in positions associated with lesser chances of attaining a leadership position (i.e., leadership prospects)" (Rider et al., 2016, p. 11).

Post-hire stacking in inferior positions "produce[s] racial disparity in organizational leadership by allocating minorities to positions that are peripheral to the organization's central mission and consequently do not provide position-holders with opportunities to develop the skills or visibility necessary for career advancement ... racial minorities will typically hold positions associated with lesser chances of attaining a leadership position" (Rider et al., 2016, pp. 11, 12). Rider et al. (2016) found that "performance-reward bias strongly influences promotions to coordinator positions but does not influence promotions to head coaching positions" (p. 37). In other words, a primary occupational mobility access barrier for coaches of color exists at the coordinator level. For example, the vast majority of African American offensive position coaches oversee running backs or wide receivers whereas only two African American coaches currently hold the quarterbacks coach position, which functions as a primary pipeline to become an offensive coordinator.

# RECOMMENDATIONS FOR NFL AND NCAA PIPELINE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS

In 2017, the National Basketball Association (NBA) developed the NBA Basketball Operations Associate Program in order "to prepare former NBA and WNBA players to pursue career opportunities in team management positions." This newly created innovative one-year full-time immersive applied learning program at the NBA league office provides four strategically selected former professional basketball players with extensive training within the areas of league operations and initiatives as well as player development and programming. The NBA developed a customized and comprehensive curriculum for participants in this program. Curriculum components include business acumen training sessions and core competency learning modules. A similar one-year intensive program at the NFL league office might support and complement existing career development programming such as the Bill Walsh Diversity Coaching Fellowship along with NFL player development boot camps and academies.

Key NFL stakeholders are encouraged to examine the potential impact of creating new best practice guidelines or formal league policies related to the head coach and general manager search and hiring processes. For example, one proposed new guideline/policy would provide any recently fired head coach of a team with a winning record in the most recent NFL season (e.g., Jim Caldwell and Mike Mularkey in 2017) with a guaranteed interview with all teams searching for a new head coach for the next NFL season. Another proposed new guideline/policy would require an NFL league executive (i.e., former NFL head coach or former NFL general manager) to attend and participate in the head coach and general manager interview process for each team in order to ensure consistency and integrity throughout the interview process (for example, helping to ensure that the most prepared and compelling candidates are provided with a meaningful opportunity to interview along with helping to ensure that the ultimate hiring decision is merit-based as a result of the interview process). Based on data provided by the NFL league office, as of January 19, 2018, NFL teams either interviewed or sought to interview 42 total candidates for the seven recent open head coach positions. Men of color represented thirteen of the 42 total candidates (31%) for these interviews (and planned interviews that ultimately did not take place). At least five NFL teams either interviewed Steve Wilks or invited Wilks to interview but an interview did not occur. Based on the NFL dataset, Wilks was the only man of color to receive an opportunity to interview for more than one of the open head coach positions; all other eight men of color were only invited to interview for one of the open head coach opportunities. In addition, Bobby Johnson —then-current African American tight ends coach for the Oakland Raiders—earned an opportunity to interview for the Oakland Raiders head coach position. Not only was Johnson not selected for the head coach position, but he also was fired as tight ends coach of the team shortly after new head coach Jon Gruden took office. With respect to recent general manager hires, as of January 19, 2018, NFL teams interviewed (or sought to interview) 21 total candidates. Men of color represented seven of the 21 total candidates (33%) for these interviews (and planned interviews that ultimately did not take place). Despite being provided with the opportunity to interview, only one person of color (Steve Wilks) was ultimately offered one of the seven recently filled head coach positions or the seven recently filled general manager positions.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH**

This research study relied on data provided by the NFL along with publicly available data as reported by NFL teams. Researchers did not have access to NFL team notes and records from job candidate interviews, which would have provided more extensive insight with respect to the hiring decision-making process. In addition, this research study did not track the entire career trajectory of each individual coach, coordinator and general manager examined in the study. The following recommendations for future research are made based on the findings in this research study.

Future research should further examine the "downward mobility" patterns of former NFL head coaches, general managers, and offensive and defensive coordinators of color in order to determine the impact and extent of minority vulnerability thesis implications within the NFL. For example, in January 2018 Edgar Bennett experienced a downward occupational mobility shift when he accepted the wide receivers coach position with the Oakland Raiders after serving as the offensive coordinator of the Green Bay Packers. Kris Richard experienced a similar downward occupational mobility shift during the same month, as he transitioned from working as the defensive coordinator of the Seattle Seahawks to accepting a defensive backs coach and defensive passing game coordinator position with the Dallas Cowboys. Also in February 2018, Terry Robiskie experienced a similar downward occupational mobility shift, as he transitioned from working as the offensive coordinator of the Tennessee Titans to accepting a wide receivers coach position with the Buffalo Bills.

Future research should further examine recent occupational mobility patterns of head coaches, offensive coordinators and defensive coordinators at National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) Football Bowl Subdivision (FBS) athletics programs in order to determine if similar occupational access barriers exist at the collegiate level. Research in this area should also analyze the number of NFL head coaches, coordinators and position coaches that have prior coaching experience at an FBS football program (for example, recently hired offensive coordinators Brian Daboll and Mark Helfrich). This data could provide tremendous insight on the importance and value of aspiring NFL coaches gaining extensive experience at the collegiate level.

Future research should also analyze the occupational mobility patterns of individuals who hold coaching positions such as "special teams assistant," "assistant running backs coach" or "assistant linebackers coach" to determine the impact of social capital and other applied theoretical constructs on the career prospects of these position coaches.

Future research should also examine the career transitions of former NFL general managers such as Scot McCloughan and Doug Whaley who are now working on entrepreneurial initiatives within the sport business industry. In addition, future research should include focus groups and individual meetings with former team executives (e.g., former NFL general managers such as McCloughan and Whaley) who were responsible for hiring head coaches, coordinators and position coaches in order to develop a database of qualitative insights with respect to the subjective elements of the interview and new hire decision-making process.

Future research should analyze the potential career development impact of football television analyst/ commentator positions (and other media-related positions). For example, in January 2017 current ESPN NFL analyst Louis Riddick interviewed to be the general manager of the San Francisco 49ers. After serving as a scout and director of pro personnel with two NFL teams from 2001-2013, Riddick transitioned to working as a football analyst with ESPN. In addition, former ESPN analyst Jon Gruden was recently named the head coach of the Oakland Raiders.

Finally, future research should examine strategies to improve the overall hiring and decision-making process in order to expand the length of tenure ("opportunity to prove themselves") for head coaches, coordinators and position coaches. For example, NFL teams have made 32 total changes at the offensive coordinator position during the previous two NFL seasons alone. Several offensive coordinators (for example, Mike McCoy, Rick Dennison and John Morton) were recently fired following only one season in their respective positions. This extremely high turnover rate in key team leadership roles is not ideal from a player development or career trajectory/sustainability perspective.

# REFERENCES

Acker, J. (2006). Class questions, feminist answers. New York: Routledge.

Adler, P. and Kwon S.W. (2002). Social capital: Prospects for a new concept. Academy of Management Review, 27(1), 17-40.

Cochran, Jr. J. and Mehri, C. (2002). Black coaches in the NFL: Superior performance, inferior opportunities.

**Collins, B.** (2007). Tacking unconscious bias in hiring practices: The plight of the Rooney Rule. New York University Law Review, 82(3), 870-912.

Cunningham, G. and Sagas, M. (2005). Access discrimination in college athletics. Journal of Sport & Social Issues, 29(2), 148-163.

Davis, K. and Moore, W.E. (1945). Some principles of stratification. American Sociological Review, 10(2), 242-249.

**Day, J. (2018).** Climbing the ladder or getting stuck: An optimal matching analysis of racial differences in college football coaches' job-level career patterns. Research in Social Stratification and Mobility, 53, 1-15.

**Day, J.C. and McDonald, S.** (2010). Not so fast my friend: Social capital and the race disparity in promotions among college football coaches. Sociological Spectrum: Mid-South Sociological Association, 30(2), 138-158.

**Dovidio**, J. and Gaertner, S. (1998). On the nature of contemporary prejudice: The causes, consequences, and challenges of aversive racism. In Confronting racism: The problem and the response (Eberhardt, J. and Fiske, S. eds). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc.

**Fernandez, R.M., Castilla, E.J., and Moore, P.** (2000). Social capital at work: Networks and employment at a phone center. American Journal of Sociology, 105, 1288-1356.

**Gabbay, S.M. and Zuckerman, E.W**. (1998). Social capital and opportunity in corporate R&D: The contingent effect of contact density on mobility expectations. Social Science Research, 27, 189-217.

Greene, L. (2012). Head football coaches: Ending the discourse of privilege. Wake Forest Journal of Law & Policy, 2(1), 115-142.

Greenwald, A. and Krieger, L.H. (2006). Implicit bias: Scientific foundations. California Law Review, 94(4), 945-967.

Kay, A., Gaucher, D., Peach, J., Laurin, K., Friesen, J., Zanna, M., and Spencer, S. (2009). Inequality, discrimination, and the power of the status quo: Direct evidence for a motivation to see the way things are as the way they should be. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 97(3), 421-434.

**Kay, A. and Friesen, J.** (2011). On social stability and social change: Understanding when system justification does and does not occur. Current Directions in Psychological Science, 20(6), 360-364.

**Kilduff, M., Crossland, C., Tsai, W., and Bowers, M. T.** (2016). Magnification and correction of the acolyte effect: Initial benefits and ex post settling up in NFL coaching careers. Academy of Management Journal, 59(1), 352-375.

Madden, J. and Ruther, M. (2011). Has the NFL's Rooney Rule efforts "leveled the field" for African American head coach candidates? Journal of Sports Economics, 12(2), 127-142.

Maume, D. (1999). Glass ceilings and glass escalators. Work and Occupations, 26, 483-509.

Rider, C., Wade, J., Swaminathan, A., and Schwab, A. (working paper, 2016). Racial disparity in leadership: Performancereward bias in promotions of National Football League coaches.

Rosette, A.S., Leonardelli, G.J., and Phillips, K.W. (2008). The white standard: Racial bias in leader categorization. Journal of Applied Psychology, 93, 758-777.

Sagas, M. and Cunningham, G. (2005). Racial differences in the career success of assistant football coaches: The role of discrimination, human capital, and social capital. Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 35(4), 773-797.

**Seebruck, R. and Savage, S.** (2013). The differential effects of racially homophilous sponsorship ties on job opportunities in an elite labor market: The case of NCAA basketball coaching. Sociology Inquiry, 84(1), 75-101.

Shropshire, K. (1996). In black and white: Race and sports in America. New York: New York University Press.

**Thornton, P.** (2009). The increased opportunity for minorities in the National Football League coaching ranks: The initial success of the NFL's Rooney Rule. Willamette Sports Law Review, 6(1), 45-56.

Wang, L.I. (2006). Discrimination by default: How racism becomes routine. New York: New York University Press.

Wilson, G., Sakura-Lemessy, I. and West, J. (1999). Reaching the top: Racial differences in mobility paths to upper-tier occupations. Work and Occupations, 26, 165-186.

# **BIOS OF RESEARCH TEAM & AUTHORS OF REPORT**

**Dr. C. Keith Harrison** is an Associate Professor at UCF as well as Associate Chair of the DeVos Sport Business Management Graduate Program and founding director (2006-2014) of the Sport Business Management Undergraduate Program at UCF. In addition to his role as Faculty and Innovative Curriculum Coordinator of the Sport Business Management Programs, Dr. Harrison also served as Interim and Acting DeVos Chair in the College of Business during the Fall 2014 semester. As Senior Faculty/Associate Chair of the DeVos Graduate Sport Business Management Program, Dr. Harrison has contributed in the area of academic innovation and scholarship over the last decade to one of the most prestigious graduate sport business management programs. Dr. Harrison has taught leadership, diversity and sport marketing at the graduate level, and currently teaches diversity as well as co-teaches with Reggie Saunders (Director of Global Marketing, Jordan Brand) innovation and entrepreneurship in sport and entertainment at the undergraduate level. Dr. Harrison also served as an Adjunct Associate Professor at Emory University's Goizueta Business School from 2013-2015. Dr. Harrison has over two decades of university research, teaching and service experience at the community college level (Cerritos, Fullerton and Cypress) and university level (Washington State University, Indiana University, University of Michigan, Arizona State University, and UCF). A former NCAA scholar-athlete that was a center on the football team and graduated from West Texas A&M University, Harrison went on to earn his graduate degrees at California State University (Dominguez Hills) and the University of Southern California. Dr. Harrison has numerous peer-reviewed journal articles and book chapters that all disseminated from the Paul Robeson Research Center for Academic and Athletic Prowess established in Ann Arbor at the University of Michigan (1998). Dr. Harrison was Co-Editor of the Journal of Issues in Intercollegiate Athletics (2009-2011) housed at the University of North Carolina (Chapel-Hill). He is currently Editor of the Journal of Higher Education Athletics & Innovation housed at Oklahoma University. He also wrote and co-edited a book with Scott Bukstein on Sport Business Analytics published by Taylor & Francis (2016). Dr. Harrison's career focus is in a few areas: the identity of the student-athlete and professional athlete experience; diversity and inclusion issues related to gender and race relations in education, business, sport and entertainment; and the marketing of emerging multicultural demographics in the global environment in terms of fan engagement. Dr. Harrison's brief list of clients/ partnerships past and present include the NFL, the Minnesota Vikings, Oakland Raiders, Miami Dolphins, University of Oregon, Jordan Brand, Boise State University, UCLA's School of Education, Wharton Sports Business Academy, UC-Boulder's Business of Sport Certificate Program, Florida Citrus Sports and numerous intercollegiate athletic departments through his co-founded non-profit Scholar-Baller. Since 2012, Dr. Harrison has been the principal investigator/researcher and co-author with Bukstein for the NFL's "Good Business" series in terms of diversity and inclusion initiatives within the NFL as well as on female spectators and influencers of the NFL brand. Harrison also served as the lead educational consultant and special/senior advisor for the Ross Initiative in Sports for Equality (RISE), which is a not-for-profit organization founded by Miami Dolphins team owner Stephen Ross. Harrison and Bukstein developed and implemented a comprehensive academic curriculum focused on diversity, inclusion, respect and equality in sport along with creating marketing and branding content for RISE. Harrison is a guest columnist for the SportsBusiness Journal in the area of cultural innovation in sport business and entertainment management.

**Scott Bukstein** is the Director of the Undergraduate Sport Business Management Program within the College of Business Administration at the University of Central Florida. Bukstein is also the Associate Director of the DeVos Graduate Sport Business Management Program at UCF. In addition, Bukstein has served as an Adjunct Assistant Professor within the Goizueta Business School at Emory University (2013-2015) as well as an Adjunct Instructor within the College of Business at the University of South Florida (2014-present). Bukstein's research focus is on the intersection of sport and the law, collective bargaining in professional sport, business analytics in sport, the business of collegiate athletics and professional sport, the perceptions and academic performance of college student-athletes, mobility patterns and career paths of coaches and other executives, and leadership and diversity/ inclusion issues in sport. Bukstein is also a licensed attorney.

Acknowledgments: A special thank you to Sara Hayes and Sudith Lima for their assistance with data collection.